

Similarly, the Fourth Assessment erroneously claimed that “[t]he Netherlands is an example of a country highly susceptible to both sea-level rise and river flooding because 55% of its territory is below sea level where 60% of its population lives and 65% of its Gross National Product (GNP) is produced.”<sup>117</sup> The Dutch government has asked for a correction to that claim, noting that only 26 percent of the country is below sea level.<sup>118</sup> Trimo Vallaart, the Dutch environment ministry spokesman, said he regretted the fact that proper procedure was not followed, and added that it should not be left to politicians to check the IPCC's numbers.<sup>119</sup> He also said that the Dutch government “will order a review of the report to see if it contains any more errors.”<sup>120</sup>

### 3. RAIN FOREST CONCLUSIONS BASED ON NON-PEER REVIEWED SOURCES

As with the errors regarding Himalayan glaciers, rural Chinese weather stations, and Dutch land, the Fourth Assessment contains an improperly sourced and unverifiable claim about the Amazon rainforest. In the Fourth Assessment, the IPCC cited a WWF report<sup>121</sup> claiming that, due to climate change, “[u]p to 40% of the Amazonian forests could react drastically to even a slight reduction in precipitation . . . .”<sup>122</sup> The WWF report’s authors claimed their findings were based on an article in *Nature*,<sup>123</sup> but the sentence in the *Nature* piece that the WWF report relied on was about how logging, rather than climate change, affected the forest.<sup>124</sup> Similarly, the IPCC’s Fourth Assessment cited an article published in a popular magazine for climbers which was based on anecdotal evidence from mountaineers about the changes they saw while climbing.<sup>125</sup> The Fourth Assessment also cited<sup>126</sup> a geography student’s master’s

---

<sup>117</sup> IPCC Fourth Assessment: Climate Change 2007: Working Group II: Impacts, Adaption and Vulnerability, Section 12.2.3, *Current adaptation and adaptive capacity*.

<sup>118</sup> Alister Doyle, *U.N. Climate panel reviews Dutch sea level glitch*, REUTERS, Feb. 5, 2010, available at <http://www.reuters.com/article/idUSTRE6141VU20100205> (last visited Feb. 15, 2010).

<sup>119</sup> *Dutch Point Out New Mistakes in U.N. Climate Report*, Feb. 5, 2010, available at <http://www.foxnews.com/scitech/2010/02/05/dutch-point-new-mistakes-climate-report/> (last visited Feb. 15, 2010).

<sup>120</sup> *Id.*

<sup>121</sup> Andy Rowell and Peter Moore, *Global Review of Forest Fires: A WWF/IUCN Report*, July 27, 2000, available at

[http://www.panda.org/what\\_we\\_do/how\\_we\\_work/conservation/forests/publications/?3596/Global-Review-of-Forest-Fires-A-WWF-IUCN-Report](http://www.panda.org/what_we_do/how_we_work/conservation/forests/publications/?3596/Global-Review-of-Forest-Fires-A-WWF-IUCN-Report) (last visited Feb. 15, 2010).

<sup>122</sup> IPCC Fourth Assessment Report: Climate Change 2007: Working Group II: Impacts, Adaption and Vulnerability, Summary of Expected Key Future Impacts and Vulnerabilities, Section 13.4.1, *Natural ecosystems*.

<sup>123</sup> Daniel C. Nepstadt et al., *Large-scale impoverishment of Amazonian forests by logging and fire*. NATURE vol. 398 at 505 et seq., April 8, 1999, available at

[http://www.whrc.org/resources/published\\_literature/pdf/NepstadNature.99.pdf](http://www.whrc.org/resources/published_literature/pdf/NepstadNature.99.pdf) (last visited Feb. 15, 2010) (noting that, “[l]ogging companies in Amazonia kill or damage 10±40% of the living biomass of forests through the harvest process.”).

<sup>124</sup> Christopher Booker, *Amazongate: new evidence of the IPCC's failures*, DAILY TELEGRAPH, Jan. 30, 2010, available at

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/comment/columnists/christopherbooker/7113582/Amazongate-new-evidence-of-the-IPCCs-failures.html>, (last visited Feb. 15, 2010).

<sup>125</sup> IPCC Fourth Assessment: Climate Change 2007: Working Group II: Impacts, Adaption and Vulnerability, Section 1.3.1.1 *Observed effects due to changes in the cryosphere*.

dissertation that quoted interviews with mountain guides in the Alps.<sup>127</sup> But perhaps most egregious was the Fourth Assessment's citation<sup>128</sup> to a boot cleaning manual.<sup>129</sup> Citations to these non-peer reviewed sources<sup>130</sup> and others like them refute EPA's claim that it could rely on the IPCC assessment reports because they contained peer reviewed scientific studies.

---

<sup>126</sup> IPCC Fourth Assessment: Climate Change 2007: Working Group II: Impacts, Adaption and Vulnerability, Section 1.3.1.1 *Observed effects due to changes in the cryosphere*. Table 1.2 (identifying "Loss of ice climbs" as one of several "Selected observed effects due to changes in the cryosphere produced by warming").

<sup>127</sup> Richard Grey and Rebecca Lefort, *UN climate change panel based claims on student dissertation and magazine article*, THE DAILY TELEGRAPH. Jan. 30, 2010, available at <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/earth/environment/climatechange/7111525/UN-climate-change-panel-based-claims-on-student-dissertation-and-magazine-article.html> (last visited Feb. 10, 2010).

<sup>128</sup> IPCC Fourth Assessment: Climate Change 2007: Working Group II: Impacts, Adaption and Vulnerability, Section 15.7.2., *Economic impact and sustainability in Antarctica* (citing to "IAATO, 2005").

<sup>129</sup> International Association of Antarctic Tour Operators, *Boot, Clothing, and Equipment Decontamination Guidelines for Small Boat Operators*, available at [http://www.iaato.org/docs/Boot\\_Washing07.pdf](http://www.iaato.org/docs/Boot_Washing07.pdf) (last visited Feb. 15, 2010).

<sup>130</sup> Other non-peer reviewed sources that the Fourth Assessment cites include the following: Marris, E., 2005: *First tests show flood waters high in bacteria and lead*. NEWS@NATURE, 437, 301-3011; Dey, P., 2006: *Climate change devastating Latin America frogs*. University of Alberta; Butler, A., 2002: *Tourism burned: visits to parks down drastically, even away from flames*. ROCKY MOUNTAIN NEWS. July 15, 2002; Kesmodel, D., 2002: *Low and dry: Drought chokes off Durango rafting business*. ROCKY MOUNTAIN NEWS, 25 June 2002; Wilgoren, J. and K.R. Roane, 1999: *Cold Showers, Rotting Food, the Lights, Then Dancing*. NEW YORK TIMES, A1. July 8, 1999; Welch, C., 2006: *Sweeping change reshapes Arctic*. THE SEATTLE TIMES. Jan. 1 2006; Stiger, R.W., 2001: *Alaska DOT deals with permafrost thaws*. Better Roads. June, 30-31. [Accessed 12.02.07; Business Week, 2005: *A Second Look at Katrina's Cost*. BUSINESS WEEK; September 13, 2005. [Accessed 09.02.07; Associated Press, 2002: *Rough year for rafters*. September 3, 2002; COLOMBIA TRADE NEWS, 2006: *Illegal crops damage Colombia's environmental resources*. Colombian Government Trade Bureau; FAO, 2004b: *La participación de las comunidades en la gestión forestal es decisiva para reducir los incendios (Involving local communities to prevent and control forest fires)*. FAO Newsroom FAO, 2005: *Cattle ranching is encroaching on forests in Latin America*. FAO NEWSROOM ENVIRONMENT NEWS SERVICE, 2002: *Hungry Cambodians at the mercy of climate change*. Phnom Penh, 26 November 2002. Accessed 16.05.07: <http://www.ens-newswire.com/ens/nov2002/2002-11-26-02.asp>; Balint-Kurti, D., 2005: *Tin trade fuels Congo War*. NEWS24, 07/03/2005.FAO, 2004: *Locust crisis to hit northwest Africa again: situation deteriorating in the Sahel*. FAO News Release, 17 September 2004; Sparks, T.H., H. Heyen, O. Braslavskaya and E. Lehtikoinen, 1999: *Are European birds migrating earlier?* \pard cs12BTO NEWS, 223, 8; Benedick, R., 2001: *Striking a new deal on climate change*. Science and Technology Online, Fall 2001; Schelling, T.C., 2002: *What makes greenhouse sense?* FOREIGN AFFAIRS, May/June COM/ENV/EPOC/IEA/SLT(2005)6 32; Schelling, T.C., 1997: *The cost of combating global warming, facing the tradeoffs*. Foreign Affairs, November/December Cowan, J., E. Eidinow, Laura Likely, 2000: *A scenario-planning process for the new millennium*. Deeper News, 9(1); THE ECONOMIST, 2000: *Sins of the secular missionaries*. January 29, 2000; Speth, J.G., 2002: *Recycling Environmentalism*. Foreign Policy, July/August, pp. 74-76. Shashank, J., 2004: *Energy conservation in the industrial sector: A special report on energy conservation day*. New Delhi, ECONOMIC TIMES; Nippon Steel, 2002: *Advanced technology of Nippon Steel contributes to ULSAB-AVC Program*. NIPPON STEEL NEWS, 295, September 2002; Shorrock, T., 2002: *Enron's Asia misadventure*. Asia Times 29 January, accessed 02/07/07; ISNA, 2004: *From wood to coal in an effort to stop deforestation*. Inter Services news agency (IPS), Rome; IRIN, 2004: *Angola: frustration as oil windfall spending neglects the poor*. United Nations Integrated Regional Information Networks; *WNA report forecasts three scenarios for nuclear's growth*. NUCLEAR NEWS, November 2005: pp. 60-62, 69.